



КОНГРЕС УКРАЇНЦІВ КАНАДИ

UKRAINIAN CANADIAN CONGRESS

CONGRÈS DES UKRAINIEN-CANADIENS

Canada's Defence Policy Review Public Consultation 2016

Position Paper Submitted by
Ukrainian Canadian Congress

June 2016

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The current global security situation provides both serious challenges and important opportunities to protecting Canada's security and promoting peace and stability abroad. Since the last Defence Policy Review in the 1990s, two key challenges to Canadian and global security have emerged: the threat of global terrorism and Russia's military aggression. Both of these threats need to be addressed in comprehensive policy, defence investment and action.

Since 2014, the international community had no choice but to reevaluate its assumptions following Russia's invasion of sovereign Ukrainian territory – first in Crimea, then in eastern Ukraine – which shattered any remaining illusions about the Kremlin's willingness to abide by international law or live by the rules of the institutions that Russia joined at the end of the Cold War. Russia's aggression is a challenge not only to Ukraine's sovereignty, but to Canada and the rules-based international order.

Russian actions in the Arctic present a challenge to Canada's sovereignty in the northern regions. Canada must consider ways in which NORAD needs to evolve and modernize to remain relevant into the future, and what arrangements or investments may be required to make this happen.

Canada's Defence Policy must take into account the existential threat presented to Canada and allied states by Russia's continued violation of international law. Canada's Defence Policy must look at ways to counter Russia's aggression and deter further attacks against Ukraine or other states in the region.

Canada must continue to play a key role in NATO, and continue to participate in NATO's multifaceted operations and activities. Canada must increase its commitment to training, capacity-building and closer integration and cooperation with states such as Ukraine that seek cooperation and integration into the NATO security framework.

It is in Canada's national security interest that Europe remain secure. The best way to ensure the return of peace to Europe is to ensure the success of a democratic, prosperous and strong Ukraine, whose territorial integrity and sovereignty are respected. Therefore, an area of priority for the Canada Defence Policy must be to ensure the return of peace to Ukraine and to strengthen the ability Ukraine's security forces to maintain that peace against foreign aggression.

At such time when Russia finally begins to implement its commitments under the Minsk Agreements, a large and robust international peacekeeping mission will be necessary in order to ensure effective monitoring of the comprehensive withdrawal of Russian troops, weapons and materiel from the eastern Ukrainian oblasts of Donetsk and Luhansk.

Canadian intelligence services have proven to be effective in understanding both the origins of conflicts and in finding ways to prevent future conflicts. Canadian intelligence capabilities must be leveraged to support Ukraine's ability to reform its intelligence-gathering service and to improve intelligence-sharing between NATO states and Ukraine.

Canada's Defence Policy must take into account past Canadian experience and successes and renew and reenergize Canada's commitments to peace operations around the world. Canada's intelligence capabilities must be leveraged to create further integration and increased cooperation with friendly states such as Ukraine.

Key Opportunities for Canada

Canada's Defence Policy must look at ways to counter Russia's aggression and deter further attacks against Ukraine or other states in the region. Key opportunities for Canada are:

- **Country of Focus for Canada's Technical Assistance** - It is in Canada's national security interest that Europe remain secure. The best way to ensure the return of peace to Europe is to ensure the success of a democratic, prosperous and strong Ukraine, whose territorial integrity and sovereignty are respected. Canada must ensure that Ukraine remains a "Country of Focus" for technical assistance and a key Canadian foreign policy priority.
- **Strengthening Ukraine's Security Forces** - An area of priority for Canada Defence Policy must be to ensure the return of peace to Ukraine. Strengthening the ability Ukraine's security forces to defend their citizens against foreign aggression, will prevent further bloodshed and facilitate a diplomatic resolution.
- **Extend Operation UNIFIER to 2020** - Canada has and must continue to play an important role in capacity-building for Ukraine's Armed Forces. Some 200 CAF personnel are training Ukrainian forces in tactics as part of Operation UNIFIER. Currently, Canada is committed to participate until 2017. The number of CAF personnel participating in UNIFIER must be increased substantially and Operation UNIFIER should be extended until at least 2020.
- **Canada Ukraine Defence Cooperation Agreement** - Canada must conclude negotiations on the Canada Ukraine Defence Cooperation Agreement, which would improve interoperability and deepen cooperation and investment between Canada's and Ukraine's military. Ukraine must be added to the **Automatic Firearms Country Control List**, to allow the export of certain defensive equipment to Ukraine.
- **Defensive Equipment** - Canada and NATO allies must provide Ukraine with defensive equipment – most importantly, anti-tank, anti-artillery systems and surveillance systems.
- **International peacekeeping mission** - At such time when Russia finally begins to implement its commitments under the Minsk Agreements, a large and robust international peacekeeping mission will be necessary in order to ensure effective monitoring of the comprehensive withdrawal of Russian troops, weapons and materiel from the eastern Ukrainian oblasts of Donetsk and Luhansk. Canada must play a leading role in ensuring that international monitoring of the Ukraine-Russia border is effective – either through a Mission under the auspices of the United Nations or the OSCE.
- **Toughen economic sanctions on Russia** - Canada in cooperation with the EU, the G7 and other like-minded nations must toughen economic sanctions on Russia. Such actions will deter further Russian efforts to grab more Ukrainian territory and pressure Moscow into full implementation of the Minsk agreements and withdrawal of Russian troops (and their proxies) from the territory of Ukraine, including Crimea.

INTRODUCTION

The current global security situation provides both serious challenges and important opportunities to protecting Canada's security and promoting peace and stability abroad. Since the last Defence Policy Review in the 1990s, two key challenges to Canadian and global security have emerged: the threat of global terrorism and Russia's military aggression against its neighbours. Both of these threats need to be addressed in comprehensive policy, defence investment and action.

Russia's actions (from its 2008 invasion of Georgia to its ongoing war in Ukraine) present a direct challenge to the international rules-based system that was established after WWII, particularly pertaining to the inviolability of borders and sovereignty of states.

With its invasion of Ukraine and illegal annexation of Ukraine's Crimean Peninsula, Russia has broken guarantees to respect Ukraine's territorial integrity under the Budapest Memorandum. In exchange for security guarantees from the United States, United Kingdom and Russia, Ukraine voluntarily surrendered its nuclear arsenal (the world's third largest). Russia's actions and the inadequate response from the United States and the UK in support of Ukraine's territorial integrity has placed in severe doubt the efficacy and ultimately the value of nuclear non-proliferation, removing essential incentives to halt nuclear programs or reduce nuclear arsenals.

The inadequate response from the Budapest Memorandum signatories, has emboldened the Russian Federation to continue its military campaign and occupation of Ukraine and conduct military acts and operations against NATO allies that would have been unheard of since the end of the Cold War. Recent Russian naval maneuvers in the English Channel, Russian airspace incursions in the Baltic States and Russian fighter bomber simulated attack runs on US Navy warships are examples of overt and aggressive behavior. The greatest immediate danger is that Moscow may seek a provocation in one of the Baltic States to test NATO's resolve. The recent decisions to employ battalions to each of the Baltic States reduces the danger, but does not remove it. Moscow's aggressive behavior could easily be extrapolated to Canada's Far North in terms of Russian maritime surface and sub-surface operations.

Canada's Defence Policy must take into account not only military, but also political, diplomatic and economic tools in order to protect Canada's sovereignty and promote and contribute to global peace and security.

THE SECURITY ENVIRONMENT

Consultation QUESTION: Are there any threats to Canada's security that are not being addressed adequately?

The largest threat to Canada's security, one which is not being addressed adequately, is a resurgent and belligerent Russian Federation. In 2014, Russia's invasion and occupation of Ukraine's Crimean Peninsula changed the security calculus for Canada and NATO allies. Russia's aggression in Crimea and Eastern Ukraine are a challenge not only to Ukraine's sovereignty, but to the rules-based international order. Provocations against the Baltic States – such as the kidnapping of an Estonian intelligence officer from Estonia and the seizing of a Lithuanian ship in September 2014 – suggest that Moscow is testing NATO's commitment to its easternmost members.

For the first time since the end of WWII, a state has attempted to change the borders of Europe by force. The peace and stability of the European continent is under direct threat from Russia.

Russian actions in the Arctic present a challenge to Canada's sovereignty in the northern regions. The geopolitical intelligence firm Stratfor stated,

the militarization of the Arctic — and by extension, the construction of new bases or the repurposing of old Soviet facilities — will remain one of the Russian military's top priorities in the coming years. It is likely that part of the Northern Fleet, Moscow's principal naval force and a major component of Russian nuclear deterrence, will also be based on the New Siberian Island chain, which is ideally positioned for military operations in the Arctic.¹

Canada must consider ways in which NORAD needs to evolve and modernize to remain relevant into the future, and what arrangements or investments may be required to make this happen. Strengthening NORAD must include a re-evaluation of its current roles and expansion beyond the air and maritime domains. Russia's growing presence in the Arctic, especially coupled with its assertive behaviour in Eastern Europe, clearly underlines the need for upgrading NORAD capabilities. NATO also needs a strong policy of deterrence in Europe's east to dissuade the Kremlin from further aggression. Part of this comes from building NATO's military presence in the Baltic States, Poland and Romania; part of it must come from further support to Ukraine in its struggle against Moscow's aggression.

Canada's Defence Policy must take into account the existential threat presented to Canada and allied states by Russia's continued violation of international law. Canada's Defence Policy must look at ways to counter Russia's aggression and deter further attacks against Ukraine or other states in the region.

CONTRIBUTING TO GLOBAL PEACE AND SECURITY

Consultation QUESTION - How should Canada contribute to NATO and its evolving role in global security in the years ahead?

The cornerstone of North American and European security is and must remain the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). In addition to the military aspect of NATO, it is also an organization based on common values of democracy, rule of law and human rights. Canada must continue to play a key role in NATO, and continue to participate in NATO's multifaceted operations and activities. Canada must increase its commitment to training, capacity-building and closer integration and cooperation with states such as Ukraine that seek cooperation and integration into the NATO security framework.

The Russian Federation's leaders have shown through their actions that they will only respond to strength and deterrence. Canada must continue to participate in efforts to make clear to Russia that threats against NATO allies in Eastern Europe and violations of international laws and treaties to which they are signatories will not be tolerated – particularly through participating in exercises such as Operation REASSURANCE, and committing additional CAF personnel and

¹ <https://www.stratfor.com/analysis/russia-arctic-different-kind-military-presence>

Canadian materiel to similar missions in the future. Canada must be a forceful advocate within NATO for a strong military presence in the eastern members.

The best way to ensure peace and security in Europe and for Canada's NATO allies is to ensure the success of Ukraine, and to assist the Government and people of Ukraine in building a country which is democratic, able to defend itself against external aggression, and able to protect its territorial integrity and citizens.

Canada has and must continue to play an important role in capacity-building for Ukraine's Armed Forces. CAF personnel are acknowledged throughout the world as extraordinarily effective and successful military trainers and instructors.

Canada is currently participating in training operations in Ukraine. Some 200 CAF personnel are training Ukrainian forces in tactics as part of Operation UNIFIER. Currently, Canada is committed to participate until 2017. The number of CAF personnel participating in UNIFIER must be increased substantially and Operation UNIFIER should be extended until at least 2020.

Ukraine's Department of Defence has stated its commitment to the professionalization of its military, meeting NATO standards, and reaching full interoperability with NATO Allied Forces by 2020. Canada must take a leadership role in NATO-supported efforts to assist Ukraine, particularly in the continuing reform of Ukraine's Armed Forces into a professionalized, capable fighting force that meets NATO standards.

Canada must continue to support the reform of Ukraine's military through the NATO-Ukraine Trust Funds:

- *Command, Control, Communications and Computers (C4) – where Canada is currently a Lead Nation;*
- *Logistics and Standardization – where Canada is currently a Contributing Nation;*
- *Cyber Defence;*
- *Medical Rehabilitation;*
- *Military Career Management;*
- *Counter-Improvised Explosive Devices and Explosive Ordnance Disposal*

Given that these Trust Funds were set up in 2015 with duration commitments of two years, Canada must work with Ukraine and NATO allies to ensure these Funds are operational past 2017, where necessary.

Further, as Ukraine continues the process of the reform of its military, Canada must play a leading role in NATO in assisting with the training of senior-level officers by setting up formal exchanges and training for Ukrainian officers in Canada – on issues such as the Law of Armed Conflict, the Ethics of War, and strategic questions of combat. Canadian expertise and institutions such as the Canadian Forces College would provide effective training and deepen cooperation between Canada's and Ukraine's military.

Canada must conclude negotiations on the Canada Ukraine Defence Cooperation Agreement, which would include a Permanent Joint Board on Defence and a Military Cooperation Committee, and would improve interoperability and deepen cooperation and investment between Canada's and Ukraine's military. Ukraine must be added to the Automatic Firearms Country Control List, to allow the export of certain defensive equipment to Ukraine.

To strengthen Ukraine's ability to defend itself against Russia's ongoing aggression, and to significantly raise the cost on Russia of any further attempts at incursion and occupation of into Ukraine's and neighbouring territory, Canada and NATO allies must provide Ukraine with defensive equipment – most importantly, anti-tank, anti-artillery systems and surveillance systems.

The Government of Ukraine has made NATO membership for Ukraine a strategic priority. In addition to supporting the reform and professionalization of Ukraine's military, Canada must be a leader in advocating for Ukraine's NATO membership, once pre-conditions and standards are met by Ukraine.

Finally, while this is not a NATO issue, Canada must remain a strong advocate for maintaining sanctions on Moscow for its aggression in Ukraine. Ottawa must add its voice to those in Europe opposing any easing of sanctions until Moscow fulfills all of its Minsk commitments and ends its illegal occupation of Ukraine's Crimea peninsula. And, of course, Canada must maintain its own sanctions.

Russia's invasion of Ukraine has threatened not only Ukraine, but a Europe whole, free and at peace. It is in Canada's national security interest that Europe remain secure. The best way to ensure the return of peace to Europe is to ensure the success of a democratic, prosperous and strong Ukraine, whose territorial integrity and sovereignty are respected. Therefore an area of priority for the Canada Defence Policy must be to do everything possible to ensure the return of peace to Ukraine and to strengthen the ability Ukraine's security forces to maintain that peace against foreign aggression.

A RENEWED COMMITMENT TO PEACE OPERATIONS

Consultation Question: How should the CAF help increase Canada's contribution to peace operations? What role, if any, can the CAF play in conflict prevention, mediation, and/or post-conflict reconstruction in support of wider Government of Canada efforts?

Canada has a long, proud and effective history in peacekeeping operations around the world. Canada's Defence Policy must take into account past Canadian experience and successes and renew and reenergize Canada's commitments to peace operations around the world.

The OSCE Special Monitoring Mission (SMM) currently operating in Ukraine is very limited, both in scope and effectiveness. Canada must work through the OSCE to ensure that the current SMM in operation in Ukraine can effectively monitor the security situation in eastern Ukraine, the withdrawal of Russian troops and materiel and the implementation of the Minsk Agreements.

At such time when Russia finally begins to implement its commitments under the Minsk Agreements, a large and robust international peacekeeping mission will be necessary in order to ensure effective monitoring of the comprehensive withdrawal of Russian troops, weapons and materiel from the eastern Ukrainian oblasts of Donetsk and Luhansk.

Canada must play a leading role in ensuring that international monitoring of the Ukraine-Russia border is effective – either through a Mission under the auspices of the United Nations or the OSCE.

Once Russian forces are withdrawn from Ukraine, it is vital that Ukraine has the capacity to defend that border from any future attempts at invasion by Russia or its proxies. Canada must work with Ukraine and international partners to strengthen Ukraine's capacity to monitor and defend its borders. Canada must support reforms and offer training for Ukraine's border patrol and customs agencies.

Canadian intelligence services have proven to be effective in understanding both the origins of conflicts and in finding ways to prevent future conflicts. Canadian intelligence capabilities must be leveraged to support Ukraine's ability to reform its intelligence-gathering service and to improve intelligence-sharing between NATO states and Ukraine. Canadian intelligence capabilities and best practices in air and naval reconnaissance must be leveraged to improve coordination and integration between Ukraine and Canada and NATO states.

Canada's Defence Policy must take into account past Canadian experience and successes and renew and reenergize Canada's commitments to peace operations around the world. Canada's intelligence capabilities must be leveraged to create further integration and increased cooperation with friendly states such as Ukraine.